

MINUTES OF MEETING

DEARBORN CHARTER COMMISSION

City Council Chambers

Tuesday, April 25, 2006

Due to the number of people in attendance, the meeting was moved to the City Council Chambers.

Chairman Bazy called the meeting to order at 5:45 p.m. A roll call was taken. Present were: David Bazy, Mary M. Bugeia, Stephen S. Dobkowski, Jr., John Jay Hubbard, Thomas Patrick Korte, Mary K. Petlichkoff, Ganelle Shooshanian, and Raymond Thomas Trudeau. Absent: Paula Hamilton-Stokes. Also present: Kathleen Buda, City Clerk and Debra Walling, Corporation Counsel.

Chairman Bazy asked if anyone had any questions on the minutes from the meeting from April 04, 2006.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hubbard and seconded by Commissioner Bugeia to accept the minutes of the April 04, 2006 meeting as amended. The motion passed as follows: Yeas: Bazy, Bugeia, Dobkowski, Hubbard, Korte, Petlichkoff, Shooshanian and Trudeau (8). Nays: None. Absent: Hamilton-Stokes (1). The motion was adopted.

Commissioner Hamilton-Stokes entered the Council Chambers at 5:48 p.m.

Chairman Bazy stated that Chapter 10 of the Charter contains a significant amount of information as to the overall running of the City and the Commission has made a decision to take a lot of time reviewing this chapter. The Commission needs to spend a lot of time on Chapter 10 and not hurry through it because there are significant amounts of areas that need to be reviewed. Each department in the City will be scheduled to come before the Commission and define their departments. The Commission will listen to people in the City who have a pertinent role along with the citizens that some of the things will impact. The Commission will try to listen to people in a defined methodology. In order to accomplish that, the

Commission will set up a time table for each department and document when each department will appear before the Commission so that during the times when a certain department is scheduled to appear, individuals who may be impacted will be aware of when to appear for the discussions.

Chairman Bazy further stated that the Charter is a living document and just because the Commission has reviewed something in the past, doesn't mean that they will not review it again later on. There are times for the Commission to move through and try to cover the Charter front to back and then look at the finished product to determine if they came up with something that can be approved and lived with for a significant period of time. The Commission's goal is to come up with a Charter that is appropriate to the majority of the citizens and can be approved the first time through.

Chairman Bazy continued by stating that it would be very early for the Commission to begin any finite discussions on Chapter 10. The Commission will need to hear from each of the Departments prior to having any concrete evaluations.

Chairman Bazy stated that at the last meeting, the Commission was discussing Section 9.3 and they should go back and see if they can finish this Section.

Commissioner Shooshanian stated that they were given a changed version of Section 9.3 and maybe the Commission could start by looking at that.

Debra Walling stated that these changes had been discussed two meetings ago. She asked the Commission to put this Section on hold again because she has not had the opportunity to discuss this Section with the Mayor and Council due to their busy schedule with budget hearings.

Chairman Bazy stated that Corporation Counsel was asked to define exactly what the current procedures were so that the Charter could reflect the procedures exactly as they are being performed.

Debra Walling stated that it was previously discussed whether or not the Mayor should be given the power to approve things on an emergency

basis or somehow give the Council the ability to react more quickly than the Open Meetings Act would allow them to do.

Chairman Bazy stated that at this time the Commission would leave this Section as an open item and not put it on the agenda for the May 02, 2006 meeting, but hopefully by the May 16, 2006 meeting it could be discussed then.

A motion was made by Commissioner Shooshanian and supported by Commissioner Korte to table **Section 9.3 Emergency** ordinances, until the meeting of May 16, 2006. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Bazy stated that before they move into Chapter 10, Carolyn Buell from the League of Women Voters would like to address the Commission.

Carolyn Buell, Vice President, League of Women Voters Dearborn/Dearborn Heights, addressed the Commission. Ms. Buell stated that when the 1979 Charter was adopted, the League of Women Voters had members on the Commission and studied the document before it was adopted. She also stated that Charter revision should be more than a line by line review of the present text. She continued by stating that there are government departments within local colleges along with the Michigan Municipal League and Citizen's Research Council who can be consulted for their expertise in the field. Ms. Buell stated that the League of Women Voters would be glad to help if the Commission needs assistance in securing consultants.

Chairman Bazy asked if anyone in the audience had any general discussions that they wanted to come forth with on Chapter 10.

Don Linske, retired Battalion Chief, addressed the Commission regarding operational procedures within the Dearborn Fire Department along with the current structure of the fire department staffing. He stated that if the number of firefighters required by the Charter were to be reduced, they would have a hard time filling the minimum on duty number to keep all the companies in service.

Commissioner Petlichkoff asked Mr. Linske what makes up the bulk of the department's runs, whether it is fire runs, traffic accidents or emergency runs.

Mr. Linske stated that emergency medical services comprises about 75% to 80% of the runs, fire is approximately 20% to 25% of the runs.

Commissioner Shooshanian asked Mr. Linske if the City was short on staff and they needed more help, could the City depend upon the communities around us to call for help.

Mr. Linske stated that yes the City of Dearborn belongs to two different mutual aid pacts that they can call on in an emergency. These pacts work two ways, the City of Dearborn can be called upon by another city as well.

Chairman Bazy stated that there has not been one time that the Administration has said that they want to reduce the work force. The Administration suggested that the language be changed to include not only population but another factor such as number of runs.

Jeff Gee, President, Dearborn Police Officers Association addressed the Commission. Mr. Gee stated that the voters were well informed of the minimum staffing proposition which was placed on the ballot. The public voted overwhelmingly to support this proposition.

Commissioner Dobkowski asked Mr. Gee if the Police Department is currently up to the minimum staffing levels in terms of number of police officers.

Mr. Gee stated that the department is currently at 188 officers and the Charter requires 203 officers, making the department 15 officers short according to the Charter.

Commissioner Petlichkoff asked Mr. Gee if he had looked at the formula that Lieutenant Leavens had presented to the Commission at their last meeting.

Mr. Gee stated there can be many criteria which go into a formula for determining how many officers are needed. He stated that his concern is

who determines what the criteria are. He feels that the Police Department has probably the most expertise in determining the criteria; but, they could also be self serving to some extent.

Chairman Bazy stated that it will be a while before the Police Chief will be able to bring data and present a more definitive proposition of what their thought process would be. In 2004 and 2006 there are certainly significantly different budgetary issues that face the State of Michigan, the City of Dearborn, and other municipalities in this area. You can't put up a test to determine what the community might want to have in an overall budgetary fashion. Next week when Jim O'Connor appears before the Commission and he details the current budget restraints and what the impact is going to be to the City, the Commission will have a better understanding of the total overall breadth of what it means.

Commissioner Petlichkoff asked Mr. Gee if the union would consider flexibility or a suspension of the staffing mandates if the budget nosedived and caused other departments to be drastically reduced.

Mr. Gee stated that the union is willing to discuss anything that is brought to the bargaining table, but he does not know if they can cross the line between what is in the Charter and what can be negotiated in a labor agreement.

Mark Andrew, Dearborn Firefighter, stated that the EMS runs that the Fire Department makes are revenue generating runs. Last year, the Fire Department billed \$2.5 million for EMS service of which, approximately \$1.5 million was collected. For Dearborn residents, insurance, if available, pays for the service. Non-residents are expected to pay the full amount for the service.

Dennis Mooney, Chief Steward, Teamsters Operative Unit addressed the Commission. Mr. Mooney stated that the Union is looking for an expansion of Section 10.18 to better represent what Public Works and the rest of the workers throughout the City do on a regular basis. The current Charter uses old language which doesn't taken into account the new technologies that have developed. He stated that the Union proposes that the Commission adopt a section in the Charter that establishes a fact finding panel of three individuals hear a case in order to resolve its differences involving the Operative Unit and the Municipal Workers of Dearborn: one

individual appointed by the Union, one by the City and the third appointed by an agreement of the first two or by the State of Michigan. The recommendation of the panel would be adopted by both the Union and the City and a settlement would be reached within the framework of the majority decision of the panel in each issue. He stated that the Union is asking the Commission to take a good look at Section 10.18 and the Union would like to have some input into the Section before the Commission takes any action.

Chairman Bazy stated that the commission is very interested in listening to what the Union has to say, but he is very reticent to put the Commission into a position where they get involved with contract negotiations and bargaining. The Commission is interested in defining what each department does.

Chairman Bazy concluded the meeting by stating that the May 02, 2006 meeting will consist of Jim O'Connor with a presentation about the budget and Kurt Giberson with a presentation about the Department of Public Works. He stated that because there is so much information in Chapter 10 that needs to be brought forth, he recommends that instead of continuing to talk about things that will be discussed later, that this be a short meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner Trudeau and supported by Commissioner Korte to adjourn.

The Charter Commission meeting adjourned at 7:08 p.m.